



**STATE OF NEW YORK**  
**OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL**

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN  
Attorney General

STATE COUNSEL DIVISION  
Litigation Bureau

Writer Direct: (518) 776-2622

November 2, 2016

Hon. Christian F. Hummel  
United States Magistrate Judge  
United States District Court  
Northern District of New York  
James T. Foley U.S. Courthouse  
445 Broadway, Room 441  
Albany, NY 12207

Re: *Smith v. Perlman*  
9:11-CV-00020 (MAD)(CFH)

Dear Magistrate Hummel:

Please accept this letter as my notice of appearance on behalf of defendants in this matter. Mr. Kevin Hayden will no longer be assigned to this matter and the defense of this case for defendants has been transferred to me. If any questions or concerns arise regarding this filing or any matter concerning this case, please do not hesitate to contact me at any time.

Respectfully yours,  
/s/ Keith J. Starlin  
Keith J. Starlin, A.A.G.  
Bar Roll No.: 105187  
Appearing for Defendants  
Office of the Attorney General, Litigation Bureau  
The Capitol  
Albany, New York 12224-0341  
Phone: (518) 776-2622  
Email: [keith.starlin@ag.ny.gov](mailto:keith.starlin@ag.ny.gov)

Page 2  
November 2, 2016

cc: Colin Reardon  
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale & Dorr LLP - NY Office  
7 World Trade Center  
250 Greenwich Street  
New York, NY 10007